Lesson Plan: The Trial of Anne Hutchinson
Colonial North America

By Aaron Jura

Common Core State Standards:
CCSS.ELA-Literacy.RH.9-10.1
CCSS.ELA-Literacy.RH.9-10.3

Overview: This lesson is designed for use in a high school classroom on a 90-minute schedule. Differentiation for struggling readers is provided in primary source materials (footnotes are employed). Students will discuss the events and outcomes of the trial with guiding questions as a method of formative assessment of student comprehension. Teachers should look for students to cite both explicit and inferred evidence from the texts to determine the efficacy of the direct instruction. The Prezi presentation is designed for use as a visual aid and a pacing guide for the lesson. Due to the length of the 90-minute schedule I have also included a second hook to discuss the Puritan lifestyle in a modern context.

Objectives:
• Students will closely read chunked excerpts of primary and secondary source material regarding the Trial of Anne Hutchinson
• Students will reenact the events using a primary source transcript of the trial of Anne Hutchinson.
• Students will analyze the events and outcomes of Anne Hutchinson’s trial with scaffolded comprehension using graphic organizers

Materials:
• Smart Board, Elmo, or Projection capabilities (recommended)
• Prezi Presentation on Anne Hutchinson and Puritanism
• Guided notes on Anne Hutchinson and Puritanism
• Excerpts from the Trial of Anne Hutchinson (primary source)
• Excerpts from the Trial of Anne Hutchinson (differentiated with word bank)
• Witness Statement (graphic organizer)

Activities:
1. Introduce Anne Hutchinson and Puritanism using Prezi Presentation with guided notes for students to complete as you discuss the elements of the presentation.
   a. Prezi Link: http://prezi.com/mczyfk9ock9g/?utm_campaign=share&utm_medium=copy&rc=ex0share
2. Using an excerpted primary source from the trial transcripts students will act out and discuss the charges of Anne Hutchinson. Scaffolding provided for SPED, ELL, and struggling learners through the use of a version of the same source with a footnoted word bank for assistance with comprehension.
3. Students examine an image of Anne Hutchinson from the trial and focus attention to the facial expressions, describing them in writing.
4. Students select a differentiated assignment as individual practice that will be used as a measure of summative assessment. Students may complete a witness statement (provided) citing evidence from the trial excerpt to support their ideas or they may select to illustrate a scene from the trial and summarize the image and reasons (citing evidence from the transcript) they found this scene important.

Procedures:
- **Activity 1:** Using the Prezi presentation as a visual for a continuing unit on Colonialism students will be exposed to an overview of the theories of Calvinists, Puritan issues in England, 5 Points of Calvinism, and Winthrop’s sermon A Model of Christian Charity.
  - The Origins of Calvinism: Read aloud the slide to students as they fill in guided notes. Play video clip introducing Calvinism as students answer guided questions on the clip in their guided notes.
  - TULIP: Explain each of the theories of TULIP and connect the ideas back to assigned vocabulary for the unit:
    - Total Depravity: Because of the sins Adam and Eve made against God every person is born sinful.
    - Unconditional Election: God only saves those he wants to. Only a few people will achieve salvation. God also decides if you will be saved or damned at birth – there is no way to influence this predestination.
    - Limited Atonement: The death of Jesus was only for those who were chosen for salvation. Jesus did not die for everyone.
    - Irresistible Grace: Grace is the saving and transformational powers of God. God’s grace is freely given – it cannot be earned or denied.
    - Perseverance of the Saints: The chosen saved people have the right and the ability to interpret the will of God and live a truly moral life. You cannot go against the will of God.
  - Puritanism in England: Read aloud the slide to students as they fill in guided notes. Discuss the significance of the map and proximity of the Puritans and Pilgrims.
    - Why would the Puritans want to settle where they did based upon the experiences of the Pilgrims?
    - Why are Puritans more successful than Pilgrims considering their proximity to each other?
  - A Model of Christian Charity: Read aloud the slide to students as they fill in guided notes.
    - How does the sermon help to prepare Puritan settlers for the possible experiences in the Massachusetts Bay colony?
- **HOOK VIDEO:** What would it be like to have a Puritan as a roommate? Play film and discuss with the students the differences with the philosophies of Puritans versus modern ideals.
• Puritan Culture: Read aloud the slide to students as they fill in guided notes. Discuss elements of puritan culture and work ethic. Biographically describe Anne Hutchinson prior to primary source activity.

○ Activity 2: Hand out primary sources to students and assign roles of Anne Hutchinson and Governor Winthrop. Provide footnoted version to students who are struggling with reading comprehension. Students will roll play the primary source as a mini-mock trial.
  - DOK Comprehension Questions:
    - What is Anne Hutchinson charged with?
    - Other than holding meetings, why was Anne Hutchinson brought to trial?
    - What role do you think Anne’s gender had on her expulsion from the colony?

○ Activity 3: Close reading image of Anne Hutchinson defending herself at trial. Students will answer questions relating to the facial expressions of Anne and the men in the image. Discussion about the Puritan concepts about women and their place in Puritan society.
  - Is Anne Hutchinson depicted as a weak person or a strong person?
  - Based upon the image, would you think this is an accurate description of typical Puritan women?
  - What emotions do you see when you examine Anne’s facial expression? What about the men in the image?

○ Activity 4: Differentiated Summative Assessment – Students will select to either complete a witness report from the trial of Anne Hutchinson where they both cite explicit and inferred evidence from the primary source and secondary source (lecture) to answer a series of guiding questions or students will illustrate the scene from the primary source, caption the image, and write a one paragraph summary on the back of the image citing inferred and explicit evidence from both primary and secondary sources.
**Guided Notes Worksheet: Anne Hutchinson and Puritanism**

**The Origins of Calvinism:**

__________________________ is named after John Calvin. Calvin is originally from France, but is well known for his time spent preaching in _________________________. Calvin was very inspired by the work of ____________________; however, Calvin's ______________________ has some differences. Calvin believed that _______________ by an individual would not be enough to change God's mind about that individual and their _______________________________. The harder Calvinists __________________ the more they prosper. With prosperity, Calvinists become ______________________ of their own salvation.

**Film Clip Notes -- John Calvin and Calvinism:**

How many decades did it take for the Protestant reformation movement to become a revolution?

What are the major differences between John Calvin highlighted in the film clip?

How do the teachings of Luther differ from those of Calvin?
Why do Calvinists choose to put such a focus on hard work?

The 5 Points of Calvinism:

T
U
L
I
P

Summarize the 5 Points of Calvinism:

________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
________________________________________________________________________
Puritans in England:

Puritan citizens in England feel __________________________ and misunderstood by the King and the Church of England. King Charles I didn't appreciate the Puritan citizens' __________________________. Puritans had many things to complain about as well. The Puritans did not appreciate English society's approach to the __________________________ of the church. Puritans held disdain for the __________________________ and the King's marriage to a Catholic, Henrietta Maria, was particularly annoying to Puritans. Due to the numerous complaints, Puritans migrate to the New World in _________________ and settle approximately __________________________ from the __________________________ settlements of __________________________. A total of nearly _________________ settlers arrive in Massachusetts Bay, led by __________________________, and begin to __________________________ the land.
A Model of Christian Charity:

On board the ________________________, John Winthrop delivers a sermon titled _______________________________. In this ________________________, Winthrop presents the puritan settlers with a motivational yet ________________________ lesson on the possibilities and challenges they will face in the New World. He coins an extremely important phrase in the sermon, calling for the establishment of a "___________________________". Many U.S. Presidents throughout history, including John F. Kennedy and Ronald Reagan, have quoted this phrase over the years. The main message of the sermon is to tell Puritan believers that they will either _______________________________ -- together.

Puritan Culture and Anne Hutchinson:

Puritans in the ____________________________ colony expanded upon John Calvin's doctrine and the beliefs of ____________________________ to form the ____________________________. Puritans believe that salvation through God can only be attained through the ____________________________ of God himself -- not through ____________________________. The Puritan philosophy and many of the arguments of the time period were focused on the issues of salvation through grace (__________________________). Puritans were extremely hard working people. The Puritans valued work and were successful at settling the colony partially due to their dedicated work ethic. Anne Hutchinson, a settler in the Massachusetts Bay colony, went head to head with leaders of the Puritan colony (including John Winthrop) and ultimately is brought to trial and charged with ____________________________.
Close Reading Images:

How would you describe Anne Hutchinson's facial expression?

How would you describe the Men's expressions?
Choose and complete one of the following assignments:

1. Fill out a witness statement about the Trial of Anne Hutchinson -- citing evidence of the claims you are making about the trial.

2. Illustrate a scene from the trial, caption the image with a quote being spoken in the scene from the primary sources provided, and on the back of the illustration write a one paragraph summary of the trial citing evidence from the provided sources or lecture notes.

Evidence requirements in writing:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Text Evidence</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Skillfully blends evidence from the text by using <strong>both</strong> direct quotes and paraphrases.</td>
<td>Cites evidence from the text by using <strong>both</strong> direct quotes and paraphrases.</td>
<td>Cites evidence from the text by using <strong>either</strong> quotes or paraphrases.</td>
<td>Does <strong>not</strong> reference text evidence.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provides insightful explanation/analysis of how text details support opinion.</td>
<td>Provides clear explanation/analysis of how text details support opinion.</td>
<td>Provides some explanation/analysis of how text details support opinion.</td>
<td>Provides no or incorrect explanation/analysis of how text details support opinion.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provides <strong>more than enough &amp; the strongest</strong> evidence to support opinion.</td>
<td>Provides <strong>enough related</strong> evidence to support opinion.</td>
<td>Provides <strong>limited and/or vague</strong> evidence to support opinion.</td>
<td>Provides very little and/or unrelated or incorrect evidence to support opinion.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**FINAL DUE DATE:** ________________________________
Mr. Winthrop, Governor: Mrs. Hutchinson, you are called here as one of those that have troubled the peace of the commonwealth\(^1\) and the churches here; you are known to be a woman that hath had a great share in the promoting and divulging\(^2\) of those opinions that are causes of this trouble, and to be nearly joined not only in affinity\(^3\) and affection with some of those the court had taken notice of and passed censure upon, but you have spoken divers things as we have been informed very prejudicial to the honour\(^4\) of the churches and ministers thereof, and you have maintained a meeting and an assembly in your house that hath been condemned\(^5\) by the general assembly as a thing not tolerable nor comely in the sight of God nor fitting for your sex, and notwithstanding that was cried down you have continued the same. . . .

Mrs. Hutchinson: I am called here to answer before you but I hear no things laid to my charge.

Gov.: I have told you some already and more I can tell you.

Mrs. H.: Name one

Sir. Gov.: Have I not named some already?

Mrs. H.: What have I said or done?

Gov.: Why for your doings, this you did harbour\(^6\) and countenance\(^7\) those that are parties in this faction that you have heard of.

Mrs. H.: That’s matter of conscience,

Sir. Gov.: Your conscience you must keep or it must be kept for you.

Mrs. H.: Must not I then entertain\(^8\) the saints because I must keep my conscience.

Gov.: Say that one brother should commit felony or treason and come to his brother’s house, if he knows him guilty and conceals him he is guilty of the same. It is his

---

1. colony
2. speaking
3. natural liking or sympathy for a person
4. Honor
5. damned
6. to give home or shelter to
7. support
8. listen to
conscience to entertain him, but if his conscience comes into act in giving countenance and entertainment to him that hath broken the law he is guilty too. So if you do countenance those that are transgressors\(^9\) of the law you are in the same fact.

**Mrs. H.:** What law do they transgress?

**Gov.:** The law of God and of the state.

**Mrs. H.:** In which particular?

**Gov.:** Why in this among the rest, whereas the Lord doth say honour thy father and thy mother.

**Mrs. H.:** Ey Sir in the Lord. . . .

**Gov.:** Why do you keep such a meeting at your house as you do every week upon a set day?

**Mrs. H.:** It is lawful for me to do so, as it is all your practices and can you find a warrant for yourself and condemn me for the same thing? The ground of my taking it up was, when I first came to this land because I did not go to such meetings as those were, it was presently reported that I did not allow of such meetings but held them unlawful and therefore in that regard they said I was proud and did despise\(^10\) all ordinances, upon that a friend came unto me and told me of it and I to prevent such aspersions\(^11\) took it up, but it was in practice before I came therefore I was not the first. . . .

**Gov.:** Well, we see how it is we must therefore put it away from you or restrain you from maintaining this course.

**Mrs. H.:** If you have a rule for it from God’s word you may.

**Gov.:** We are your judges, and not you ours and we must compel you to it.

**Mrs. H.:** If it please you by authority to put it down I will freely let you for I am subject to your authority.

---

\(^9\) violators of law, rule, or duty

\(^10\) to dislike, hate

\(^11\) a false accusation, a lie about a person’s character
Mr. Winthrop, Governor: Mrs. Hutchinson, you are called here as one of those that have troubled the peace of the commonwealth and the churches here; you are known to be a woman that hath had a great share in the promoting and divulging of those opinions that are causes of this trouble, and to be nearly joined not only in affinity and affection with some of those the court had taken notice of and passed censure upon, but you have spoken divers things as we have been informed very prejudicial to the honour of the churches and ministers thereof, and you have maintained a meeting and an assembly in your house that hath been condemned by the general assembly as a thing not tolerable nor comely in the sight of God nor fitting for your sex, and notwithstanding that was cried down you have continued the same. . . .

Mrs. Hutchinson: I am called here to answer before you but I hear no things laid to my charge.

Gov.: I have told you some already and more I can tell you.

Mrs. H.: Name one

Sir. Gov.: Have I not named some already?

Mrs. H.: What have I said or done?

Gov.: Why for your doings, this you did harbour and countenance those that are parties in this faction that you have heard of.

Mrs. H.: That’s matter of conscience,

Sir. Gov.: Your conscience you must keep or it must be kept for you.

Mrs. H.: Must not I then entertain the saints because I must keep my conscience.

Gov.: Say that one brother should commit felony or treason and come to his brother’s house, if he knows him guilty and conceals him he is guilty of the same. It is his conscience to entertain him, but if his conscience comes into act in giving countenance and entertainment to him that hath broken the law he is guilty too. So if you do countenance those that are transgressors of the law you are in the same fact.

Mrs. H.: What law do they transgress?

Gov.: The law of God and of the state.
Mrs. H.: In which particular?

Gov.: Why in this among the rest, whereas the Lord doth say honour thy father and thy mother.

Mrs. H.: Ey Sir in the Lord. . . .

Gov.: Why do you keep such a meeting at your house as you do every week upon a set day?

Mrs. H.: It is lawful for me to do so, as it is all your practices and can you find a warrant for yourself and condemn me for the same thing? The ground of my taking it up was, when I first came to this land because I did not go to such meetings as those were, it was presently reported that I did not allow of such meetings but held them unlawful and therefore in that regard they said I was proud and did despise all ordinances, upon that a friend came unto me and told me of it and I to prevent such aspersions took it up, but it was in practice before I came therefore I was not the first. . . .

Gov.: Well, we see how it is we must therefore put it away from you or restrain you from maintaining this course.

Mrs. H.: If you have a rule for it from God’s word you may.

Gov.: We are your judges, and not you ours and we must compel you to it.

Mrs. H.: If it please you by authority to put it down I will freely let you for I am subject to your authority.
Witness Statement
The Trial of Anne Hutchinson

Answer the following questions and complete the witness statement using explicit and inferred evidence from the primary and secondary source materials discussed in class.

1. Why did Governor Winthrop say that Mrs. Hutchinson was required to show up in court?

2. Summarize the claim of Governor Winthrop regarding a person who hides his brother’s crimes:

________________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________________

3. Based upon what you have learned from Puritan culture in the lecture, video, and trial reenactment how does the trial transcript represent the ideals present in Puritan culture?

________________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________________
4. Write a one paragraph summary of the main arguments in the case against Anne Hutchinson, cite evidence to explain your answer: